

Special Meeting of Council Agenda

Tuesday 12 June 2018

5:30PM

Council Chambers, Civic Centre,
Stuart Highway, Katherine

Notice of Meeting of Council
Notice is hereby given in accordance with Section 59
of the Local Government Act

1. Welcome to the Country

I am honoured to be on the ancestral lands of Katherine's Aboriginal peoples. I acknowledge the First Australians as the traditional custodians of the continent, whose cultures are among the oldest living cultures in human history. I pay respect to the Elders of the community and extend my recognition to their descendants who are present.

2. Opening Prayer

Grant O God to this Council wisdom, understanding and sincerity of purpose in the Governance of this Municipality. Amen

3. Present

4. Apologies and Leave of Absence

5. Disclosure of Conflict of Interest

6. Reports of Officers

6.1 Collection and Disposal of Domestic Waste _____ 1-8

7. Meeting Close



KATHERINE TOWN COUNCIL

REPORT

FOLDER: Tenders / Works / COLLECTION AND DISPOSAL OF DOMESTIC WASTE

MEETING: SPECIAL MEETING OF COUNCIL – 12 JUNE 2018

REPORT TITLE: TENDER 18/02 – COLLECTION AND DISPOSAL OF DOMESTIC WASTE

PURPOSE OF REPORT

To seek endorsement from Elected Members to award Tender 18/02 Collection & Disposal of Domestic Waste in the Katherine Municipality.

BACKGROUND

Tender T18/02 Collection & Disposal of Domestic Waste with a number of different pricing schedules in addition to the regular domestic waste service;

- Schedule 1 – Regular Domestic Waste Service - Comprising of the collection and disposal of the contents of a maximum of one bin from each nominated premise on each visit per week. This was priced on quantity of 3300 residences.
- Schedule 2 – Extra Domestic Bin - Comprising the removal and disposal of the contents of each extra bin so nominated by the Council with such work to be done concurrently with the Regular Domestic Waste Service
- Schedule 3 – Extra Clearance - Comprising the removal and disposal of the contents of each extra bin so nominated by the Council where such work is required at any time other than at the time of the Regular Domestic Waste Service
- Schedule 4 – Non-Domestic Litter Bins - Comprising the removal and disposal of the contents of each Industrial and 240 Litre wheelie bin so nominated by the Council the work to be carried out on the day or days specified by the Council.
- Schedule 5 – Community Events - Comprising the collection of waste during community events in Katherine when instructed by Council.
- Schedule 6 – Potential additional costs associated with relocation of Waste Transfer Facility.
- Schedule 7 – Alteration of existing collection area - Altering the area to which the Domestic Waste Collection Service is offered by extending the area up to the Municipality Boundaries of Katherine.

FINANCIAL CONSIDERATIONS

Tender 18/02 – Collection & Disposal of Domestic Waste was advertised from Wednesday 11 April for a period of Two (2) weeks, with submissions closing at 2:00pm on Friday 18 May 2018. Four (4) valid tender submissions were received, one (1) via the Tender Box at the Civic Centre and three (3) through Council's e-Tendering portal Tenderlink; details to follow.

Budget Impact

The budget estimate was \$300,000.00 (GST exclusive) for T18/02 Collection & Disposal of Domestic Waste. This estimate was based on the Regular Domestic Collection indicative costs



KATHERINE TOWN COUNCIL

REPORT

from previous years. Schedules 2 – 7 were priced based on a per bin rate which can vary in quantity and frequency from month to month so Schedule 1 alone was used for the cost comparison.

As referenced in the following Schedule of Rates Summary table, the four (4) tenders and their respective submitted values (GST inclusive);

	<i>Schedule 1</i>
1. Cleanaway	\$271,814.40
2. Veolia	\$328,631.16
3. NT Recycling Solutions	\$349,206.00
4. MT Bins	\$305,791.20

NB: individual line item values are not shown in the summary due to commercial in confidence considerations.

Further commentary as to the Tender Assessment Panel's interpretation of the price variance rationale is referenced within 'Summary of Assessment'.



KATHERINE TOWN COUNCIL

REPORT

VALUE FOR MONEY ASSESSMENT (VFM)

A qualitative (operational, non-priced criteria) and quantitative (goods and services, priced criteria) assessment of each valid tender submission was undertaken by an Assessment Panel comprising the following officers:

Sharna Ross – Governance Officer

Andrew Wilson – Manager – Compliance, Regulatory & Environmental Services

Jamie Craven – Executive Manager, Infrastructure & Environment

Section 1.13 of the tender document describes the method by which the Tender Assessment Panel shall review all valid submissions, outlines the relevant documentation which all tenderers should be familiar with, and provides the following percentage breakdown of the Non-Priced Criteria relevant to the specification (as agreed upon by the Panel prior to release of the specification).

PERCENTAGE WEIGHTINGS AND ASSESSMENT CRITERIA FROM RESPONSE SCHEDULES	
PAST PERFORMANCE	15%
LOCAL DEVELOPMENT AND VALUE ADDING	15%
CAPACITY	20%
PRICE	50%
TOTAL	100%

Commentary from the Panel regarding each tenderer's submission (including, but not limited to any perceived and/or actual risks or vulnerabilities, and any information supplied in addition to that which was requested), is collated and used to finalise the qualitative assessment of the Non-Priced Criteria; detail is provided further in the 'Summary of Assessment'.

The final Value for Money rating for each Tenderer is shown in the attached VFM Assessment – Summary (Attachments C) and referred to below:

- | | |
|---------------------------|--------|
| 1. Cleanaway | 98.18% |
| 2. Veolia | 84.81% |
| 3. NT Recycling Solutions | 77.79% |
| 4. MT Bins | 90.56% |



REPORT

Summary of Assessment

The following summary comprises the Panel's assessment of the individual tender submission's responses against the noted Non-Priced Criteria requirements and the average score from ten (10) allocated per criterion (refer Attachment C for scoring matrix).

Cleanaway

Past Performance – 9
Local Development and Value Adding – 7.67
Capacity – 9

Veolia

Past Performance – 8.33
Local Development and Value Adding – 6.67
Capacity – 8.33

NT Recycling Solutions

Past Performance – 7
Local Development and Value Adding – 6
Capacity – 7.67

MT Bins

Past Performance – 7.17
Local Development and Value Adding – 8
Capacity – 6.83



KATHERINE TOWN COUNCIL

REPORT

Recommended Submission

The Tender Assessment Panel recommends Cleanaway Pty Ltd as representing the greatest Value for Money return to the Council for those works specified in T18/02 – Collection & Disposal of Domestic Waste

Cleanaway returned significant scores across all Non-Priced Criteria, providing the least vulnerable alternative for Council's consideration, whilst presenting a heightened contribution to the local community through their generous support to local events and community groups.

The submission value of \$271,814.40 (GST inclusive) for the Schedule 1 being the regular weekly domestic waste collection falls within the available project budget and accommodates all tender stipulations; the variance from the estimate is reflective of the realistic market value for the procured works. Cleanaway's competitive rates for the optional services were also reflected in Schedules 2 – 7 even though these were not factored into the price comparison.

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION

That it be recommended to Council:

1. That Tender 18/02 – Collection & Disposal of Domestic Waste in the Katherine Municipality, be awarded to Cleanaway at their submitted schedule of rates price of \$271,814.40 (GST inclusive).

Robert Jennings
CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER

Delegation:

Executive Manager – Infrastructure & Environment, Jamie Craven

Attachments:

A: Tender Opening Declaration
B: Best Practice Guidelines for Tender Assessment – FS#1 (excerpt);
Value for Money (VFM) Scoring Matrix
C: Value for Money (VFM) Assessment



KATHERINE TOWN COUNCIL

REPORT

CONTRACT No:	T18/02	
PURPOSE:	COLLECTION AND DISPOSAL OF DOMESTIC WASTE IN THE KATHERINE MUNICIPALITY	
ADVERTISED:	In Katherine Times 11 Apr 18, KTC Website and E-Tender	
CLOSING:	Friday 18th May 2018 @ 1400hrs	
OPENED:	Tuesday 22nd May 2018 @ 0839hrs	
PRESENT:	Sharna Ross, 	Jamie Craven, 
	Andrew Wilson 	
RECEIVED:	BUSINESS NAME	VALUE \$ (Inc GST) Weekly Regular Rate
	Cleanaway Waste Management	5227.2
	NT Recycling Service	6715.5
	Veolia Environmental Services	6319.83
	MT Bins	5880.6


Kebside Collection Total Value.

Cleanaway : \$271,814.40 inc GST

NT Recycling: \$399,206.0 inc GST

Veolia : \$328,631.16 inc GST

MT Bins: \$365,791.20 GST

present: Andrew
Wilson


Sharna
Ross


Jamie
Craven




KATHERINE TOWN COUNCIL

REPORT



BEST PRACTICE GUIDELINES FOR TENDER ASSESSMENT – FS#1

FACTSHEET: SCORING TENDERS

This Factsheet outlines the recommended tender assessment scoring method and provides a value for money assessment matrix and an accompanying descriptor scale, suitable for use in the procurement of most supplies.

VALUE FOR MONEY ASSESSMENT TOOL

The standard evaluation tool/spreadsheet is based on normalised evaluation methods. This method uses a weighted comparative evaluation matrix to determine which Tender represents the best value for money available in the market. It does this by examining the Tender against the stated selection criteria and the market responses received.

SCORING SCALE

SCORE *	DESCRIPTION
9	The panel is completely confident the Tenderer: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Understands the requirements; and • Will be able to satisfactorily complete the requirements to a very high standard.
7	The panel is confident that the Tenderer: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Understands the requirements; and • Will be able to satisfactorily complete the requirements to a high standard.
5	The panel is reasonably confident that the Tenderer: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Understands the requirements; and • Will be able to satisfactorily complete the requirements to a reasonable standard.
3	The panel has some reservations whether the Tenderer: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Understands the requirements; and • Will be able to satisfactorily complete the requirements. If Minor concern: rate higher (4) If Major concern: rate lower (1 or 2)
0	The Tenderer did not address the requirement or The panel is not confident that the Tenderer: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Understands the requirements; and / or • Will be able to satisfactorily meet the requirement.

* 'In between' scores such as 2, 4, 6, 8 and 10 are acceptable.

Source: Government of Western Australia



VALUE FOR MONEY (VFM) ASSESSMENT - SUMMARY

Tender T18/02	Collection and Disposal of Domestic Waste	Cleanaway	Veolia	NTRS	MT Bins	<Company>	<Company>	<Company>	<Company>	<Value>	<Value>	<Value>
Budget \$300,000.00	Value \$271,814.40	\$328,631.16	\$349,206.00	\$305,791.20								

Weighting 15%	Past Performance	9.00	8.33	7.00	7.17	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
15%	Local Development and Value Adding	7.67	6.67	6.00	8.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
20%	Capacity	9.00	8.33	7.67	6.83	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
50%		43% ✓	39% ✓	35% ✓	36% ✗	0.00 ✗	0.00 ✗	0.00 ✗	0.00 ✗	0.00 ✗	0.00 ✗	0.00
50%	Price	55%	46%	43%	54%	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!	#VALUE!

VFM Ranking ● 98.18% ● 84.81% ● 77.79% ● 90.56% #VALUE! #VALUE! #VALUE! #VALUE!

Recommended Tenderer: Cleanaway

Commentary:
 Best value and demonstrated capacity to provide quality service to municipality
 Generous support to local events and community groups and shop locally
 Good evidence of quality management systems

With a VFM Score of: 98.18

Panel Members Endorsement:
 Jamie Craven _____ **Date:** 29/5/18
 Andrew Wilson _____ 29/5/18
 Sharna Ross _____ 29/5/18